

CALL TO ORDER

A Regular Meeting of the Planning and Zoning Commission of the City of Coolidge was held in the Council Chambers located at 911 S. Arizona Boulevard, Coolidge, Arizona. Chairman Halbe called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. Those present were Chairman Ray Halbe, Vice Chairman Hanna Peterson, Commissioner Ken Bolan, Commissioner Al Metcalf, Commissioner Philip Bacon, Commissioner Rosalinda Federico and Commissioner Matt Duran. Also present was Development Services Director Gilbert Lopez and GIS Coordinator Tim Hansen.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chairman Halbe led the Pledge of Allegiance.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

July 8, 2020

Mr. Hansen stated the minutes were not done and would be provided at the next meeting.

OLD BUSINESS:

None

NEW BUSINESS:

A. COOLPZ 20-07-28: A proposed *Zoning Code Amendment* submitted by Chris Ross on behalf of Desert Valley Pharmacy Services, Inc. amending *Section 1008.B*.

Public Hearing, Discussion and Action.

Director Lopez gave some background on the request before the Commission. There was discussion.

Chairman Halbe opened the public hearing. No members of the public wished to speak. Chairman Halbe closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Metcalf **Motioned** to approve COOLPZ 20-07-28, **Seconded** by Commissioner Bolan. Motion passed unanimously.

B. COOLPZ 20-06-23: A *Major Site Plan* submitted by Navin Pathangay on behalf of Cave Creek Real State LLC for a greenhouse and related site improvements located at 1341 W. Industrial Drive in Coolidge, Arizona, APN 209-25-017A.

Public Hearing, Discussion and Action.

Vice Chairman Peterson recused herself from this item citing a conflict of interest. Director Lopez gave some background on the request before the Commission, Mr. Hansen provided some additional history on the property. There was discussion.

Chairman Halbe opened the public hearing. The applicant, Navin Pathangay, spoke on behalf of the project and conveyed his appreciation for the helpful nature of City staff while working on the project. No other members of the public wished to speak. Chairman Halbe closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Bacon **Motioned** to approve COOLPZ 20-06-23, **Seconded** by Commissioner Bolan. Motion passed unanimously.

C. COOLPZ 20-06-24: A *Major Site Plan Amendment* application submitted by East Line Solar LLC and Central Line Solar LLC for an 926 acre Solar Farm located near the intersection of Selma Highway and Eleven Mile Corner Road, Coolidge, Arizona, APN's 401-20-004B, 401-69-001E, 001F, 001G, 001H, 001J, 002D, 401-85-003Q, 003R, 003S, 003U, 003V, 003X, 003Y and 402-02-001E.

Public Hearing, Discussion and Action.

Director Lopez gave some background on the request before the Commission. Mr. Hansen provided some details related to the request, noting a Minor Site Plan Amendment had been processed and approved after the initial Major Site Plan approval. Commissioner Bolan asked if there were any houses within the "island" area of the site, to which Mr. Hansen stated there were not. There was little discussion.

Chairman Halbe opened the public hearing. The applicant, Carisa Davis, conveyed that the site was being developed by as two separate solar projects and additionally noted that access had been provided to the "island" area referred to earlier by Commissioner Bolan. Keith Kingston, 2536 E. Ivy Lynn Circle in Mesa, Arizona, stated he owned property in the area and wanted to know if he would retain his access. Mr. Hansen responded that Mr. Kingston would retain any legal access he had. No other members of the public wished to speak. Chairman Halbe closed the public hearing.

Vice Chairman Peterson **Motioned** to approve COOLPZ 20-06-24, **Seconded** by Commissioner Bacon. Motion passed unanimously.

D. COOLPZ 20-07-26: A *Rezoning Application* submitted by Vision Companies on behalf of David McHenry Family Trust for approximately 24.4 acres of land located south of Coolidge Avenue, between the railroad and Adams Street, in Coolidge, Arizona, changing the zoning from *Planned Area Development (PAD)* to *Multi-Family Residential (R-4)*, APN 205-12-009G.

Public Hearing, Discussion and Action.

Director Lopez gave some background on the request before the Commission. Director Lopez further stated that the applicant would like to develop an apartment complex on the site and that was the purpose of the rezoning request. There was discussion.

Chairman Halbe opened the public hearing. The applicant, Bardo Brantley with Vision Companies, spoke to the quality of the project, the various amenities, and noted that they had completed projects of this type in three other states. Michele Barton, 780 S. Jefferson Street, stated that her property is adjacent to the site and wondered what kind of fencing the project would install. Mrs. Barton also said they have livestock and was concerned that the new development may complain of the associated odors. Mr. Hansen clarified that this area is approved for single family residential development and that this request was to change the zoning to allow for apartments instead. Mr. Hansen said that Mrs. Barton's concerns were completely valid, but a more appropriate venue to speak of her concerns would be during a future Major Site Plan

public hearing, that she would also be notified of. No other members of the public wished to speak. Chairman Halbe closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Metcalf **Motioned** to approve COOLPZ 20-07-26, **Seconded** by Commissioner Bolan. Motion passed unanimously.

E. COOLPZ 20-07-27: A *Rezoning Application* submitted by Vision Companies on behalf of David McHenry Family Trust for approximately 4.5 acres of land located south of Coolidge Avenue, between the railroad and Adams Street, in Coolidge, Arizona, changing the zoning from *Planned Area Development (PAD)* to *Commercial Office (C-O)*, APN's 205-12-009H and 205-12-009J.

Public Hearing, Discussion and Action.

Director Lopez gave some background on the request before the Commission. Director Lopez and noted that this rezoning was related to the previous case. Mr. Hansen stated the requested C-O zoning would limit commercial development to professional office type uses, complementing the proposed multi-family development to the south. There was discussion.

Chairman Halbe opened the public hearing. No members of the public wished to speak. Chairman Halbe closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Bacon **Motioned** to deny COOLPZ 20-07-27, **Seconded** by Vice Chairman Peterson. Motion passed unanimously.

F. COOLPZ 20-07-25: A *Conditional Use Permit Application* submitted by Ray Halbe for a Manufactured Home in the *Agricultural (AG)* zoning district located at 1651 E. Byrd Avenue, east of Nafziger Road, in Coolidge, AZ, APN 209-22-012E, Resolution 20-04.

Public Hearing, Discussion and Action.

Chairman Halbe recused himself from this item because he was the applicant. Director Lopez gave some background on the request before the Commission. There was discussion generally related to the prevailing development type in the area.

Vice Chairman Peterson opened the public hearing. Karen Lyne, 1602 E. Byrd Avenue, said they had lived there for 3 years, the applicant had built a block wall that subsequently blown down and took more than a year to fix, and that the waste block had been dumped on a neighboring property. Mrs. Lyne said lots of junk is stored on the property as well. Commissioner Bolan asked Mrs. Lyne to share the photos she brought. Mrs. Lyne was worried that if the manufactured home was allowed it may encourage more manufactured homes to move in. Commissioner Bolan asked if zoning allowed for the parking of vehicles or storage on a lot without a principal use. Mr. Hansen said it is possible depending on the use. The applicant, Ray Halbe, said that he at one point owned the property to the south and intended to combine the two parcels but never did. Maria Rodriguez, 457 N. Nafziger Road, did not speak into the microphone and her comments were inaudible. Frank Garcia, 1695 E.

Kennedy Avenue, ask about someone potential putting a single-wide manufactured home on the lot the east of the subject site. Mr. Hansen answered that no home may be built on that lot unless a variance is granted and that if a manufactured home was applied for it could only be double-wide. Mr. Garcia stated his opposition to placing any new manufactured homes in the area. Jack Stapley, 1312 E. Treasure Cove Drive in Gilbert, Arizona, stated he owns the lot immediately west of the subject site and said that his property is the one the block was dumped on. Mr. Stapley said that all the new development in the area was semi-custom homes and stated his opposition to allowing a manufactured home. Terry Shepard, 1650 E. Byrd Avenue, spoke about storage on the subject site and said he felt a manufactured home was out of character for the area. Mr. Shepard said that waste block had also been dumped on the property to the east of the subject site that the new owner had since cleaned up. Mr. Shepard further stated his opinion that a manufactured home would decrease the value of other properties around it. Brian White, 1576 E. Lindbergh Avenue, stated he agreed with the other statements made in opposition to the manufactured home. Mr. Halbe responded to comments related to the block wall citing the failure of a contractor to properly deal with the situation. Mr. Halbe provided some information related to values of manufactured homes provided by a vendor and stated his disagreement with the alleged adverse effect in value a manufactured home would cause, further stating that it was a common myth not backed by fact. Mr. Halbe said that what he has applied for was an allowable use for the zoning of the property and asked that he be allowed to build the house he wanted on his property. Commissioner Bolan asked if the zoning did in fact allow for manufactured homes to which Mr. Hanse replied yes, by issuance of a Conditional Use Permit, while a "stick-built" house is a Principally Permitted Use. Commissioner Bolan shared his opinion that manufactured homes today can look as good or better than traditional built housing, saying he understands some of the opposition but if done properly should not have an adverse effect. Mr. Hansen relayed to the Commission that in addition to the standard conditions imposed, the Commission had the option to deny the application, approve it, or place additional conditions on the approval that would need to be met to develop the site. Karen Lyne questioned what kind of conditions or assurances they had that a certain value of manufactured home be used and said that she had been unable to obtain a loan for a manufactured home in the past. Cathy White, 1576 E. Lindbergh Avenue, stated her agreement with opposition to allowing a manufactured home, stating concerns about how the property will be maintained. Commissioner Bolan responded that whether a manufactured home or a traditional home was placed, type of housing did not materially affect maintenance of the property. Commissioner Bolan said that the manufactured homes of today are well built and that he personally likes them. John Lyne, 1602 E. Byrd Avenue, stated Byrd Avenue was not city maintained and he did not want additional traffic, and also that the properties were on a shared well and the water pressure was already low so he did not want to add anyone else. Lisa Shepard, 1650 E. Byrd Avenue, said that all the houses being built are traditional in nature and she liked stucco not siding, also speculating that her value would drop and since she just refinanced based on current value she would never be able to sell her

house. Mr. Halbe cited a study done by the University of Michigan on the effect of manufactured homes on adjacent home values found that traditional built homes realized comparable appreciation in value regardless of their proximity to manufactured housing. Commissioner Bolan asked if the houses being built in Desert Ranches were required to be site built. Mr. Hansen responded he believed so, but only because it was a platted subdivision and the developer had self-imposed that restriction. Commissioner Bolan stated his observation that opposition to granting the CUP was near unanimous from surrounding property owners. Commissioner Metcalf stated that he lived in a manufactured home and his home was just as nice as any other. Commissioner Metcalf expressed his disappointment in others passing judgement on whether or not someone's house would be nice enough for them to live next to. Commissioner Metcalf further said that one could more easily build a cheap house on the subject site without going through this process. A woman stepped to the projection screen but her comments were inaudible, she did not state her name or address. Commissioner Metcalf said the 50 year old trailer everyone kept referring to was an unfair comparison to what was being proposed. Jack Stapley stated that no one was attacking whether or not a manufacture home could be nice, and the neighborhoods concerns were not really about a manufactured home but rather the applicant himself. Mr. Halbe addressed comments made about the fence made throughout the night. Mr. Halbe acknowledged the mess on-site and committed to cleaning it up, stating his desire to make the property look nice and reiterating that what he is requesting is allowed under the zoning code. No other members of the public wished to speak. Vice Chairman Peterson closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Metcalf **Motioned** to approve COOLPZ 20-07-25 and Resolution 20-04, **Motion** failed due to lack of a **Second**. Vice Chairman Peterson asked if there were more questions or further discussion, there was not. Commissioner Bolan **Motioned** to table COOLPZ 20-07-25 and Resolution 20-04, **Seconded** by Commissioner Bacon. Motion passed unanimously.

**CHAIRMAN/DIRECTOR
REPORTS:**

Director Lopez spoke about an article in the Coolidge Examiner showcasing KB Homes, also mentioning Richmond American, DR Horton, and Century Communities. Director Lopez said staff expected a Major Site Plan submittal from Nikola that the Commission may see as soon as the September meeting.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC:

No members of the public wished to speak.

ADJOURNMENT:

Motion was made by Vice Chairman Peterson to adjourn, **Seconded** by Commissioner Bolan. Motion carried unanimously. Meeting adjourned 7:45 pm.